

Sample Paper assignment 3 – grade “C”

**Note:** Student earned an A on assignment 4 after making significant improvements

---

### Facts

Pat, the plant manager of one of ABC’s five plants, is faced with **the ultimate dilemma (rephrase)**. She has to choose whether she will expose the truth of the company to one of her friends or maintain her integrity with the company. Pat, being a manager of the plant for the company, is required to keep information **from higher-ups strictly private (re-phrase for clarity)**. With this knowledge Pat will not be allowed and should not reveal or give any hints to her friend about the situation as it would compromise the integrity of the situation and her position in the corporation. [ F1] **The down side of her position** is that she will have to let down a friend in need. [ F2]


### Issue

With this the ethical dilemma sprouts this question, what is the right answer; help the company or the close friend? There are two theories here to consider to **make (wc.)** the best decision.




### Ethical Lenses and Analysis

The first theory Pat should consider is the Categorical Imperative Theory, which basically says that a person should make his/her decision based on the universal law. What does this mean? It means that if the majority follows a certain way the best advice is to not stray away from the community’s choice. [ F3] With **his (sp.: this)** knowledge Pat should not compromise the integrity of her company revealing the confidential information to her friend that is her subordinate. Pat also has to consider her friend whom, if laid off, could be in a **serious financial bind (meaning is not clear)** that could affect him/her. By not telling her friend, Pat could lose a possible close friend. With this decision she must consider how important her job is to her. If she chooses to reveal the confidential information she must consider the consequences of it. [ F4]

The second theory Pat ought to use, before making a decision, **and consider (delete words)** is the Virtue Ethics theory. This theory states that an individual’s personal views of true ways will help with the decision making. [ F5] This theory allows Pat to use her own judgment, ways, and ethical values to pass judgment of the predicament at hand. So if Pat sees herself to have more integrity with ABC company **she would keep her end of the bargain** and not reveal a single bit of the information she knows to **ANYONE** that was her subordinate. [ F6] On the other hand if Pat considers herself to be honest to her friend, she will reveal to that person what she





knows. The irony of the situation is that by being true of her friend she will go against the company, and vice versa. [ F7]







### Conclusion

The end decision here is simple (rephrase). She should not choose to expel the confidential information she knows. Both theories suggest this. With the first theory, it suggests that other members of this company would not reveal the information that is reported to them in sheer confidentiality. The second theory would suggest that her integrity to the company is more important. She must consider that her integrity to the company is more important than to that of her **SUBORDIANTE** (sp.: subordinate). [ F8] [ F9] [ F10]

### Legend:

 - Critical Thinking	 - Knowledge Application
 - Written Communication	

Criteria	ID	Focus	Feedback	References
	[F1]	Critical Thinking	You should provide a context for the reader by first describing the facts to the case.  Also, it is not clear how this option emerges. You may want to reorganize your thoughts more logically.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F2]	Written Communication	The meaning is not very clear here. Rewrite, expressing yourself directly and more clearly.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F3]	Knowledge Application	Your explanation of the theory is not accurate or complete. Also, clearer and more direct language will more effectively convey your ideas.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F4]	Knowledge application	Explain, how do you come to this conclusion?	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4

Criteria	ID	Focus	Feedback	References
	[F5]	Knowledge Application	Your explanation of the theory does not come across very clearly. You seem to misunderstand the theory being applied.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F6]	Critical Thinking	What does this mean? You need to explain this better!	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F7]	Knowledge Application	So, what does Virtue ethics imply for Pat's dilemma? You also need to consider other aspects of honesty and fairness that apply for Pat to consider ( i.e., towards her boss, the company, and the other stakeholders).	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F8]	Critical thinking	While you have made an attempt to conclude your paper, the conclusion needs to be much more clearly connected to the analysis and application of the two ethical theories above.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F9]	Knowledge application	A major weakness of your paper is that the application of the theories is either inaccurate or lacking. You must more fully apply the theories in a more accurate manner to better to support your decisions.	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4
	[F10]	Written Communication	<p>Much of your paper is confusing in areas. Being able to effectively apply and discuss the ethical theories requires you to fully understand how they operate.</p> <p>You should work to improve your paper by organizing your ideas to flow logically from one to the other.</p> <p>Try reorganizing your paper using the following items – Facts, Issue, Analysis, Conclusion. You should also refer to the 8 steps cited in Trevino, and the discussion about the</p>	Assignment Guidelines; Trevino & Nelson, 2006, ch. 1-4

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>ID</b>	<b>Focus</b>	<b>Feedback</b>	<b>References</b>
			<p>theories (and application of the facts to the theories) within Trevino and your online lectures on ethics.</p> <p>It may also help you organize your ideas within each of the paragraphs. In addition, you could also try to make more convincing arguments by fully supporting your ideas.</p> <p>Also, carefully choose your words, as they are there to convey a certain meaning. It helps the reader better understand your ideas when you write directly, concisely, and precisely.</p>	